

ZANESVILLE CITY COUNCIL MEETING – TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 12, 2019

The Zanesville City Council met in regular session at 7:00 p.m. on Tuesday, November 12, 2019 in the City Council Chambers, 401 Market Street, Zanesville, Ohio.

Mr. Vincent led those present in the Lord’s Prayer and the Pledge of Allegiance to the Flag.

The following members of Council answered Roll Call: Mr. Foreman, Mr. Roberts, Mr. Baker, Mrs. Gentry, Mrs. Norman, Miss Bradshaw, Ms. Gildow, Mrs. Osborn, Mr. Sharrer, and Mr. Vincent.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Mr. Roberts moved to accept the minutes of October 28, 2019 as written, seconded by Mr. Foreman.

Motion carried. The minutes stand approved.

COMMUNICATIONS, REPORTS, AND RESOLUTIONS

There were none filed for this meeting.

PROPOSED ORDINANCES

Ordinance No. 19-127 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper city official to grant funds to the City of Zanesville Community Improvement Corporation resulting from the sale of property.

Mrs. Osborn moved for first reading, seconded by Miss Bradshaw.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of first reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.

Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-128 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper city official to advertise for bids and enter into a five-year lease with options for renewal or extension for the leasing of land for farming at Zanesville Municipal Airport.

Mr. Roberts moved for first reading, seconded by Mrs. Osborn.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Mr. Roberts, is there anything from committee?

Mr. Roberts: This was recommended by committee to approve.

Mr. Vincent: Recommended by Public Service Committee this evening to approve. Thank you, sir. Is there anything else from Council? We are at first reading, so all in favor of first reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-129 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance to vacate portions of unnamed alleys and portions of Pearl Street and Beech Street in the vicinity of 302 State Street.

Mr. Baker moved for first reading, seconded by Mr. Foreman.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion?

Mr. Baker: Mr. Arnett, can you tell us what this is all about, please?

Bill Arnett: Sure, the Planning Commission voted to recommend approval to Council. The vacations are needed as part of Mattingly Food's plans to expand its cold storage facility there at 302 State Street.

Mr. Vincent: Is there anything else from Council?

Mr. Baker: This is making its way to the CD committee as we discussed?

Bill Arnett: Correct this coming Monday.

Mr. Baker: Okay.

Mr. Vincent: With that there looks like significant alleys vacated, or other portions of the alleys all around it are vacated. This is just what has been occurring in the area.

Bill Arnett: There have been a lot of alley vacations. Some have been recorded and some have not. So, Tim Linn is doing the work to make sure everything gets taken care of ultimately and everything that needs to be vacated and recorded will be vacated and recorded.

Mr. Vincent: Is this something possibly something that was missed before?

Bill Arnett: Some had been vacated but not recorded. Then there were just some parts that had never been vacated. This is going to clean it all up at once.

Mr. Vincent: Okay. Alright, sounds good. Is there anything else from Council? We are at first reading so all in favor of first reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed. Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-130 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper city official to sign an amendment to the Programmatic Agreement between the City of Zanesville and the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Baker moved for first reading, seconded by Mr. Foreman.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion?

Mr. Baker: Mr. Arnett, this is making its way to the Community Development Committee as well.

Mr. Arnett: Yes, sure.

Mr. Baker: Will you go over this a little bit, please?

Mr. Arnett: The State Historic Preservation Office notified communities that have Programmatic Agreements that we need to do a new one. The current one would expire 12-31-2019. What this means is it allows us to do a more streamlined process when we are doing environmental reviews for HUD funded projects which would include our Community Development Block Grant funds. So, we are going to be going through committee on Monday with the hope of having everything wrapped up before the end of the year so we can submit it to the State Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Baker: As I recall doesn't this stream line the process in upwards of a year almost? It is pretty extensive.

Mr. Arnett: it definitely changes, if you don't have a programmatic agreement like we have then you are required to do full environmental assessments on every kind of project. When you have a programmatic agreement there are some things you just don't have to do environmental reviews on like the Community Health Worker that we partnered with the Zanesville-Muskingum County Health Department. There really isn't an environmental review for that kind of project, but if you do not have a programmatic agreement then you have to do an environmental review for every single project.

Mr. Baker: So, why is it, I mean it is great, they are in place and streamlines the project and all of that, but how is it good for the environment and the process? How do you get one of these? How are these agreements crafted?

Mr. Arnett: The programmatic agreements are crafted between the local community and the State Historic Preservation Office. This doesn't get the City around doing environmental reviews when we are talking about digging in the dirt or putting a roof on a building with a historic structure. This is simply those public service types of projects that don't have any environmental impact, but it does allow us not to have to go through the entire process.

Mr. Baker: Okay, so it is like criteria for that I am sure. Okay.

Mr. Vincent: Okay, is there anything else from Council? With that, Mr. Arnett, we need this passed at the next meeting by the latest to meet your deadline?

Mr. Arnett: I think if we have first reading tonight, and then we do the committee meeting on Monday and the second reading if we could waive and then still have the 30 day holding period we would still have it done before the end of the year.

Mr. Vincent: Before the old one would expire. Sounds good, is there anything else? We are at first reading so all in favor of first reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

ORDINANCES FOR ACTION

Ordinance No. 19-119 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to provide funds to South East Area Transit for the year 2020.

Mr. Roberts moved for second reading, seconded by Mr. Baker.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? With no discussion with that, we do have Mr. Howard Stewart, who is the Transit Director at SEAT (South East Area Transit). We thank you for coming as our guest and to update us on what is going on.

Howard Stewart: Thank you for having me, Councilmembers. The South East Area Transit, I will give you a tidbit on what we are doing in a nine month snap shot comparing the nine months of 2018 to 2019. Our street route is up about 1% as compared to last year. The second page of the hand out that I gave you is a heat map of a half-hour buffer of the jobs in Zanesville and our street routes that run. This is some information that we ran into while we were doing a fixed route study and working with OMEGA. So you can see where our fixed routes are running as according to jobs in the City of Zanesville. Our Blue Avenue and Brighton, Pine, Greenwood routes and Putnam and Maple, we are competing on a national level with large transit systems across the nation. Our ridership is 10.8 passengers, 10.6 passengers per hour. That is unheard of in rural transit systems. There are three rural transit systems in the State of Ohio that have fixed routes: Athens, SEAT, and Chillicothe. So, we are competing with individuals like COTA, San Diego, and Los Angeles, California in our ridership for hours of usage. It is through the roof. For the nine month year to date we have had 423. You can play the E & D, general public, ADA riders. The ADA of course is individuals that are disabled, and E & D is Elderly and Disabled, the program that I was talking to Dan about. We have had 2,561 unduplicated riders. So, our ridership has increased that much. Our on-time performance is 98.1%. In transits across the nation that is unheard of. Our scheduling software has transcended us into the next level as far as providing transportation. Our demand response service is up about 30% and our ridership just

continues to increase. You can see the display in the middle; we have created a one stop call center. Other transit systems around Ohio are trying to duplicate this, transit planning organization are trying to duplicate this. We are working with non-profits. We are working with agencies that have vehicles and when those vehicles are not being used we are utilizing them to help do non-emergency medical transportation getting individuals to dialysis. So, we create what is called an ITP plan for individuals. We will go out and teach you how to ride a street route. We will teach you how to do demand response. We will teach you how to ride. It is an Individual Transportation Plan. It is like an IEP (schools use an Individual Education Program to guide learning). So, there is no reason why people can't get to where they need to go. Our contract service is 24 hours a day. We are working on 24 hours a day for transportation as a whole. We are actually set up like a mini Uber and Lyft system. This past October, on the 29th, there was a summit that reported directly to Congress from Elaine Chao, the United States Secretary of Transportation, who has put this together and SEAT is being looked at nationally. We are setting the trend for what is going on with transit across the nation. I may be going to Washington to present. It was mentioned and the consultants are reporting directly to Elaine Chao who is reporting to Congress. So, we are setting a standard here. Individuals are trying to duplicate what we are doing. We have a good foothold on what we are doing. I have a great staff. They are young. We are utilizing technology, far beyond what I am used to using. We have customer service reps and we have a transit system you can be proud of here in Muskingum County. So, we have created a non-profit that is called MOMS (Mid-Ohio Mobility Solutions). We are working on getting it created, let's put it that way. I am working on the 1023. We opened our doors July 1. We had an open house on the 9th of September and there is a pilot going on in the west side of Ohio and on the east side of Ohio. OMEGA is in charge of the one on the east side of Ohio. We are the lead agency there with a ten county area trying to regionalize transportation, make it efficient to get people from Belmont County in to Tuscarawas County; from Muskingum County into Noble County possibly or into Harrison County. We are kind of doing the same thing we are doing here in Muskingum County. We are collaborating with agencies and transit centers trying to make transportation more efficient. So, Mid-Ohio Mobility Solution is like a social service agency on steroids. Here is an example of something that happened at MOMS. A gentleman called from Guernsey County and he was an elderly gentleman who got moved to a different housing facility. They didn't take his wheelchair ramp. So MOMS got on the ball and started calling around trying to get this individual; he was literally crawling down the steps to get to the vehicle, our bus, to ride. So MOMS found a funder and Kiwanis built the ramps and Zemba paid for it. So, this is what they are doing. They are finding gaps and they are filling them. They are a social service agency on steroids and they are connecting people across a ten county area. A gentleman flew in from Dayton, Ohio to get his airplane repaired in Dover and was trying to figure out an efficient way to get back home. So, he called MOMS and MOMS got him hooked up with Tuscarawas County and they brought him into Guernsey County. Guernsey County brought him to Muskingum County and from here he caught a Greyhound and went to Dayton. That is how transportation is supposed to work. This gentleman was very well off, but he was looking at the most frugal way to transport himself after delivering his airplane. So, we are moving. We have growing pains. We are creating positions. We are

swimming on top of the water and paddling very fast underneath the water, but I can tell you this: You have a transit system here that is being looked at nationally. ODOT is referring people to us, if not weekly, daily. We are talking to new individuals. There were several new transits that spired up with the 5311 funding that came out and ODOT refers them to us for how we operate, how we are set up, and how we are doing things. Are there any questions?

Mr. Vincent: Sounds great. Thank you. Are there any questions from Council?

Howard Stewart: Everything comes down to a local match. We have to have a local match. There was a funding put out at AEP and we got what we asked for. Our operating budget is \$3.6 million dollars. We have to raise \$1.8 million dollars as we only get 50% of that. So, we have to hustle and do that so that is where this local match comes into play. My budget this year is \$4,038,000. That is a pretty substantial budget. In keeping vehicles on the road we have to come up with 20% of our capital purchases for vehicles and I am looking to get our vehicles out back put under roof. The weather is hard on them. So, we have some big capital projects coming up this next year. Our software, I can't say enough about it. We have agencies using it and Genesis Hospital is. There was a study done where they were saying the community was saying there is no transportation in the medical community and people can't get to their appointments. So the medical agencies got together: Genesis, Allwell, Muskingum Behavioral Health, MVHC (Muskingum Valley Health Centers), Health Department and Genesis offered their Black Belts, Lean Six, is that what it is called, they went through a Lean Six process and what it came back to say after all the data was crunched by Brad Hollingsworth that it wasn't the lack of transportation; it was a lack of the education of transportation. So, that is what we are trying to do is educate individuals about transportation. The more they know the better off they are. There is no reason why people can't get to where they need to go and we are working on that 24 hours service. So we are working on it.

Mr. Vincent: That all sounds excellent; a lot of great stuff. Kudos to you and to your staff and everyone involved.

Howard Stewart: It goes to my staff.

Clapping broke out.

Howard Stewart: Thanks for having me.

Mr. Vincent: Thank you very much. We greatly appreciate it. Is there anything else from Council? We are at second reading so all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-120 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to provide funds to the Zanesville-Muskingum County Port Authority for organizational, promotional, and operational expenses during the year 2020.

Mrs. Osborn moved for second reading, seconded by Mr. Foreman.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none we do have Matt Abbott here, the Director of the Port Authority. He is here to share information with us and to give us updates. It is a tough act to follow here, Matt.

Matt Abbott: It is and Howard told me, I guess I have followed him for the past five years and this is the first year he has come up with a handout. So, I will have to come up with a full blown PowerPoint presentation. He does a great job and a lot of people at the state are talking about the things his team are doing at SEAT. It is always great to hear that. I appreciate the opportunity to talk to members of Council and the Administration tonight. Since 1987 the Port Authority has been the lead economic development agency for the City of Zanesville and Muskingum County. So, we take those things very serious. At this time we are seeing kind of a record year to say in investment with existing companies as well as our business attraction efforts. We look at a lot of data.

The unemployment rate is sitting at about 5.3% right now. Last year it was very similar around that 5.3% mark. When you are talking about Muskingum County as a whole, the population at 86,000 and the workforce is about 40,000 ages 18 to 60. When you really crunch the numbers and do the math there are more job opportunities out there than there are people unemployed if you look at that statistic. One thing we really value is the average wage per worker. That is something we look at when we are looking at how we attract companies that come in here and how we incentivize those companies. So, for the first time our average wage in Muskingum County is over \$40,000 at \$43,700. So, we hope to continue that trend with some of these investments that have happened from companies from the outside I think we will continue to see that. That number is up 4.7% from last year so we are really excited about that.

The Port Authority is trying to keep it simple- business retention, business attraction, and business climate. Those three things are what we hit on. Number One is business retention. We have to keep what we have so we have a pretty vibrant business retention/expansion program. Since January we have knocked on the doors and met with 40 of our largest employers in our county and in our city and had conversations with those folks. That has yielded us a lot of plants and a lot of expansion. 5 B's in the past 12 months added 100 new jobs for \$2.6 million dollars in a 50,000 square foot facility with screen printing. They added some office space as well as embroidery space. They are actively hiring currently. Dollar General pledged 45 jobs this year and is making capital investments within their facility of \$8.7 million dollars. Halliburton: \$4.1 million dollars into additional bays out at Eastpointe Business Park at their facility. Phillips Meats added 10 new jobs at a little over \$500,000 in investment in Springfield Township. We are very excited about that. I think when we look at projects, big or small if there is a way we can help a company that is what we are going to do. Phillips Meats

services about 140 Kroger locations within the Columbus market. So, they are not just a local shop. They are really branched out. Then Mattingly Foods which was alluded to earlier with 25 new jobs. That hiring is already underway and they are looking at 38,000 square feet at their facility, if you guys vacate the alleys. So, I think that will move forward either way.

Business attraction efforts, AMG Vanadium was a great win for our community. They plan to invest \$300 million dollars into a spent catalyst recycling facility. They pledged 103 jobs. There will be 500 to 600 construction jobs. So, at this point as of today they have moved over 100,000 cubic yards of dirt at the Eastpointe Business Park. They plan to be fully operational by 2021. Again, when we look back at those wages, the jobs that this company is going to bring to our community are anywhere from between 25% and 30% of that average. So, it is definitely an exciting win for us.

The United Candle Company started up the old Lumi-Lite Candle Company facility. Lumi-Lite made the decision to close their facility in January and we are very fortunate enough in the third quarter to have another company come in and basically rebuild that facility. They have pledged 100 new jobs to our community with the average wage being pretty much at our average wage here of \$40,000 mark.

Another business attractions is the National Road Business Park that we have been working on with the property purchased in 2018 in cooperation with the City of Zanesville, the Muskingum County Commissioners, and the Port Authority splitting those funds to purchase and acquire the site and continue to develop it. So, right now with those projects that we are talking about we are sitting about 85% capacity; so we do need to add capacity so we can attract other employers to come to our region it is very important. We hope to have bids going out in the first quarter of 2020 for water and sewer extension as well as a road extension within that business park. So, we are very excited about that. What we have seen in the past year is over \$364 million dollars in capital investment, over 740 new full-time jobs have been created by these companies that we are fortunate enough to work with. We have obtained over \$1.6 million dollars in grants to assist those companies for infrastructure like water, sewer, and road improvements, all for that. Existing new companies here they have received over \$5 million dollars in some sort of a federal, state, or regional grant program. So, we are very excited about that as these are dollars that we are able to capture here for the companies that are here and if not they are going elsewhere. So, that is a pretty competitive process.

The business climate, the final thing we completed the road projects, the slip project at the Eastpointe Business Park, we have a water line extension project, we have a road relocation project that we will be bidding the first quarter of 2020, we have done a lot of things around marketing, drone videos, we have done drone photography with some of our sites that we currently do have. Not only our sites as the Port Authority, but private sites that we have out there to better market those sites and put them out front. Workforce is a continual topic and I know a lot of you have heard about that. So, of our numbers of our workforce of 40,000, we still have one out of every 4 people leave our

community to go work elsewhere. About 50 percent of that 1 in 4 is going west to the Franklin County, Columbus Metro area. We are very fortunate in the fact that the surrounding communities and counties around Muskingum County and we are getting those replaced and then some so we have had a net gain with that, but we are partnering with our regional and state partners to come up with some marketing opportunities to try to capture those folks to keep them here and let them know about the opportunities that we do have in Zanesville and Muskingum County.

Again, I appreciate your continued support because without your support we wouldn't be able to assist and play the role that we do play for this community. So thank you, thank you for your time.

Mr. Vincent: Thank you, sir. We appreciate it.

Clapping broke out in appreciation.

Mr. Vincent: All great news and I said a tough act to follow, but I think you held your own so that is really good stuff. Okay, with that, we are at second reading so all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-121 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to provide funds for a Humane Officer.

Miss Bradshaw moved for second reading, seconded by Mr. Foreman.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-122 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to purchase items for employee recognition.

Ms. Gildow moved for second reading, seconded by Miss Bradshaw.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.
Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-123 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to implement an Education Reimbursement Policy.

Mr. Sharrer moved for second reading, seconded by Mrs. Gentry.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye. All were in favor. None were opposed.

Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-124 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to implement a Sick Leave Donation Policy for unaffiliated employees.

Miss Bradshaw moved for second reading, seconded by Ms. Gildow.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion? Hearing none, all in favor of second reading signify by saying aye.

All were in favor. None were opposed.

Motion carries.

Ordinance No. 19-125 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the proper City official to dispose of surplus property.

Mr. Sharrer moved to waive the readings and it was seconded by Mr. Roberts.

Mr. Vincent: Is there any discussion on waiving? The request of this is Ms. Heskett to move along to get it underway and bid before the end of the year. We will have roll call vote for waiving of the readings.

Roll call vote on waiving of the readings.

9 Ayes

0 Nays

Motion carries.

Mrs. Norman moved for passage, seconded by Mr. Roberts.

Roll call vote for passage.

9 Ayes

0 Nays

Motion carries. Ordinance is passed.

Ordinance No. 19-114 – Introduced by Council – An Ordinance authorizing the disposal of personal property that is obsolete, unneeded, and unfit for public use pursuant to R.C. 721.15.

Mr. Roberts moved for third reading, seconded by Miss Bradshaw.

Roll call vote for passage.

9 Ayes

0 Nays

Motion carries. Ordinance is passed.

Ordinance No. 19-115 – Introduced by Council - An Ordinance authorizing the Mayor to enter into an agreement with the Muskingum County Commissioners, for the reimbursement of fees paid to attorneys who represent indigent defendants in Municipal Court.

Ms. Gildow moved for third reading and passage, seconded by Miss Bradshaw.

Roll call vote for passage.

9 Ayes

0 Nays

Motion carries. Ordinance is passed.

TRAFFIC ORDERS

Traffic Order 19-09

Section One: Directly south of 300 Main Street there is an unnamed alley. The alley runs west from 4th Street for a distance of 146 feet. The alley is 7 feet wide at the west end and 10 feet wide at the east end.

Section Two: Close the alley to vehicular traffic only.

Section Three: No signage or barricades will be erected.

Ms. Gildow moved to receive and it was seconded by Mr. Baker.

Mr. Vincent: Mr. Toney, do you want to share?

Keane Toney: This alley is a very narrow alley. It is to facilitate the moving in of a barber school. So they will have a small set of steps going into the alley and closing it off as it will be used for pedestrians only for a new business downtown.

Mr. Vincent: I think we had a similar thing down at the VFW where people were stepping out a back door into traffic.

Mayor Tilton: We just closed it down, I think.

Mr. Vincent: Is there anything else from Council?

Mr. Baker: So no signage is going to be erected to let people know that it is closed to traffic?

Keane Toney: That is true. You can't get in. It is literally so close you couldn't get anything bigger than a push cart. It is that small.

Mr. Baker: Okay.

Mr. Vincent: Is there anything else from Council? All in favor of receiving signify by saying aye?

A voice vote was taken with all members being in favor. None were opposed. Motion carries. Traffic Order stands received.

MISCELLANEOUS AND UNFINISHED BUSINESS

Mayor Tilton: One thing, I am pleased to announce as I have been told that by the end of this week Wayne Avenue will be open to traffic and it has been a long project but it was done well and we will have it back open.

Mr. Vincent: That is wonderful news, Mayor. Is there anything else? That is good enough. That is great. Is there anything from the administration? Is there anything from Council?

PRIVATE PETITIONS AND COMMUNICATIONS

No Non-agenda item petitions were filed for this meeting.

Mrs. Osborn moved to adjourn and it was seconded by Mr. Sharrer. A voice vote was taken with all members being in favor. None were opposed. The motion carries.

Mr. Vincent: Thank you everyone and have a good evening.

The meeting adjourned about 7:30 p.m.

Susan Culbertson
Clerk of Council

Daniel M. Vincent
President of Zanesville City Council